

ESF Exploratory Workshop on
**Medieval Memories: Case Studies,
Definitions, Contexts**

SCIENTIFIC REPORT

Prague, Czech Republic, 2 - 6 September 2007

Convened by:
Lucie Dolezalova

Executive Summary

The ESF exploratory workshop took place as planned in September 3-6, 2007 at Vila Lanna in Prague. As envisaged, the event was interdisciplinary, collecting researchers from various areas of medieval studies who address the topic of memory in their individual researches. The participants were from a greater part early-stage researchers, they were very enthusiastic and did not skip any sessions. It proved very efficient that each participant had submitted a detailed (2-3 page) abstract of his or her paper in advance. With all the abstracts distributed two weeks before the workshop, everyone had time to prepare reactions.

The most important part of the event were vivid discussions among the participants, both during the assigned time following the individual papers and during coffee breaks, lunch breaks and in the evenings. During the final discussion, the participants decided not to try to create a common project at the moment. For the time being, we would like to concentrate on producing a quality proceedings. (The deadline for submitting the revised articles is January 31, 2008 – the participants all agreed they need time for including the critical remarks of their colleagues.) And, clearly, we will do our best to keep the network created thanks to the workshop.

The workshop organisation was smooth – all the equipment worked, the Vila Lanna accommodation and food was good, the staff was helpful. The excursions to the Jewish museum and to the medieval collection of the National Gallery in St. Agnes' convent were also greatly appreciated by the participants. It was a pleasure to meet the ESF representative, Przemyslaw Urbanczyk. The publication of the proceedings of the workshop is planned by the Brill Publishers.

Scientific content

The subject matter of memory proved to be interesting, inspiring, and by far not exhausted by contemporary scholarship. During the workshop, a great number of approaches and understandings of the concept emerged which were not always easy to harmonize. This was expected, and it was also expected that the workshop will not offer a final word on this problem.

The first day of the workshop concentrated on memory as practice of recuperating knowledge, that is, the contexts of memorizing (Morley, Birgisson, Lorenz), *artes memoriae* (Kiss, Wójcik), mnemonic verses (Dinkova-Bruun, Doležalová) and mnemonic images (Iseppi). From the second day on, wider contexts of memory were opened. These could be divided into two groups, one dealing with memory primarily as *remembering the past* both “real” and imagined (Ranković, Falvay, Whitman, Smirnova, Raspe, Purkis, and Mundal), the second concerning memory as *an ethical and social act* that involves problems of self-fashioning (remembering oneself), problems of ethical behavior (remembering norms and taboos) and problems of social and political actions (Morley, Koycheva, Giraud, Bueno, Stella, Tóth, Livini, Nemerkenyi, Florea,

Laszlovszky, and Bartlová). The two contributions stressing the role of forgetting as part of remembering (Challet and Visi) were much appreciated by the participants.

There are several points which were discussed in more detail:

1. Mary Carruthers' two monographs (*The Book of Memory*; *The Craft of Thought*) still play a fundamental role in our understanding the manifold functions of memory in medieval civilization and we are all indebted to her contribution in one way or another. Nonetheless, Mary Carruthers is far from being an infallible authority on medieval cultures of memory. Discussions held throughout the workshop revealed several relevant objections to some of Carruthers' ideas. Her interpretation of the Latin phrase "imagines agentes" appearing in the *Rethorica ad Herennium* (iii. 37 – originally *not* "imagines agentes" but "aliquid agentes imagines") attributed to Cicero, which was very influential in the Middle Ages, was hotly debated at several sessions of the workshop. Many of the participants agreed that the meaning was something like "bizarre images" or "images capable of making an effect" rather than "active images" or "images representing actions."
2. Many participants pointed out new problematics of medieval memories that can hardly be assimilated to Carruthers' categories or described and interpreted in the framework of her research, such as the medieval *administration* of memory (in forms of charters, contracts, landmarks, or records of inquisitorial procedures), *struggles* over memories within the context of various power-games, *imposing* memories by force, *oppressing* memories of historical events, such as the peasant-revolts in fourteenth-century Languedoc, or involuntary *rediscovery* of lost memories of a pagan past. One participant severely criticized Carruthers' interpretation of medieval arts
3. As far as the medieval mnemonics are concerned, they were placed into a wider context beyond the usual textual analysis – the speakers discussed their origin and use (Dinkova-Bruun), particular use by preachers (Rivers), relationship between the practice and theory of memory (*artes memoriae*) (Kiss, Wójcik) as well as their metrial existence like manuscript transmission (Doležalová) or book as an object (Morley). This approach opened up new possibilities of researching this type of texts.
4. Widely discussed was the shift from personal memory to communal one in hagiography (Falvay), as well as epic poetry (Ranković). Especially the contribution of Slavica Ranković provided a welcome theoretical background for discussing such issues.
5. Two scholars showed in their contributions very well how memory influences the physical world (Laszlovszky) and how the physical world can inspire fake memories (Raspe).
6. The workshop proved very well that the topic of memory can be approached by using various types of sources, that it is well-fitting for an interdisciplinary

research. Papers analysing literary works (Whitman, Stella) were well complemented by those dealing with historical sources (Bueno, Challet and more), images (Bartlová, Iseppi), and architecture (Laszlovszky and Raspe).

Assessment of results

A network of mostly early-stage researchers from 15 countries was created. The proceedings are planned to be published in 2008 and will, in our opinion, significantly contribute to researching and approaching the topic of memory in the Middle Ages.

The primary point of the workshop was an exchange of ideas, inspiring each other through a common search for defining, describing and approaching the field of memory in the Middle Ages. This point was fulfilled to the satisfaction of all the participants.

Final programme

Monday, September 3, 2007

8:30-8:40 opening remarks by Lucie Doležalová

8:50-10:10 chair: Lucie Doležalová

Laura Iseppi (University of Verona, Italy)

“*Exibite membra vestra*”: Verbal and Visual *Enthymeme* as Late Medieval Mnemotechnics

Stephanie Morley (University of London, UK)

Memory and the reading of prayer: the case of *The Fifteen Oes*

coffee break

11:00-12:20 chair: Kimberly Rivers

Rüdiger Lorenz (Universität Freiburg, Germany)

The late-medieval 'Summa Iovis' as a case study for the use of poems as mnemonic aids

Bergsvein Birgisson (CMS Bergen, Norway)

The Old Norse kenning as a mnemonic figure

lunch

13:30-13:45 opening remarks by Prof. Przemyslaw Urbanczyk, the ESF Representative

13:50-15:10 chair: Rüdiger Lorenz

Greti Dinkova-Bruun (Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies, Toronto, Canada)

The Verse Bible as Aide-mémoire

Lucie Doležalová (CTS, Prague, Czech Republic)

Mistake and Meaning in Bible Mnemonics: The Case of *Summarium Biblie*

coffee break

15:40-17:40 chair: Greti Dinkova-Bruun

Kimberly Rivers (University of Wisconsin Oshkosh, the U.S.A.)

Writing the Memory of the Virtues and Vices in Johannes Sintram's (d. 1450) Preaching Aids

Farkas Kiss (University of Budapest, Hungary)

The influence of *ars memorativa* on late medieval meditational practice

Rafał Wójcik (University Library, Poznań, Poland)

Staging of Memory. *Ars memorativa* and the Spectacle of Imagination in the Late Medieval Preaching in Poland

Tuesday, September 4, 2007

8:30-9:50 chair: Francesco Stella

Slavica Rankovic (Centre for Medieval Studies Bergen, Norway)

Communal Memory of the Distributed Author: testing the applicability of the connectionist model of memory to the study of traditional narratives

Dávid Falvay (University of Budapest, Hungary):

The Formation of Saint Elizabeth of Hungary's Memory

coffee break

10:20-12:20 chair: Előd Nemerkenyi

Jon Whitman (Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Israel)

Posthumous Messages: Memory, Romance, and the *Morte Darthur*

Victoria Smirnova (University of Geneva, Switzerland)

Mechanisms of actualization of the past in *Dialogus Miraculorum* by Caesarius Heisterbachensis

Regina Koycheva (Bulgarian Academy of Sciences, Sofia, Bulgaria):

Memory as a Vehicle to Construct Meaning in the 9th-century Bulgarian Hymnography of Penance

lunch

13:30-15:30 chair: Tamás Visi

Cédric Giraud (Paris, France)

Anselm of Laon in the Twelfth Century Schools, between *fama* and *memoria*

Lucia Raspe (Johann Wolfgang Goethe-Universität, Frankfurt am Main, Germany)

Props of Memory, Triggers of Narration: Time and Space in Medieval Jewish Hagiography

Milan Lyčka (Institute of Philosophy and Religious Studies, Charles University, Prague)

The Oral Torah and Memory in Rabbinic Judaism

15:30-18:00 (optional)

Tour through the Prague Jewish quarter

Wednesday, September 5, 2007

9:00-10:20 chair: Dávid Falvay

William Purkis (University of London, UK)

The Past as a Precedent: Crusade, Reconquest and Twelfth-Century Memories of a Christian Iberia

Andrea Livini (University of Salamanca, Spain)

Construction of the theatre in the Early Middle Ages: Roman *spectacula* memory in the Christian Europe

coffee break

10:50-12:10 chair: Slavica Rankovic

Vincent Challet (Université de Montpellier, France)

Peasants' Revolts Memories: *Damnatio memoriae* or hidden memories?

Tamás Visi (Palacky University, Olomouc, Czech Republic)

"Erase the memory of Amalech. Do not forget." Constructing the pagan past to be forgotten in medieval Jewish philosophy

lunch

13:50-15:10 chair: Ana Marinkovic

Carmen Florea (Babes- Bolyai University, Cluj-Napoca, Romania)

About the Remembering of Christ's Sacrifice and the Display of Social Bonds: the Functioning of the Corpus Christi Fraternity from Sibiu (Hermannstadt, Nagyszeben-Romania)

Péter Tóth (University Library, Budapest, Hungary)

Secret Events of Christ's Passion. Pseudo-Apocryphal Dialogue as Tool for Memorization and Popularization of Scholastic Wisdom

coffee break

15:40-17:00 chair: Stephanie Morley

Irene Bueno (European University Institute, Florence, Italy)

"Respondit quod non recordatur..." Memory as proof in inquisitorial records (early 14th c. France)

Előd Nemerényi (Budapest, Hungary)

The Latin Vocabulary of Memory in Medieval Hungary

Thursday, September 6, 2007

9:00-10:20 chair: Ana Marinkovic

József Laszlovszky (Central European University, Budapest, Hungary)

The memory of the landscape, the landscape of the memory. King Sigismund and the personification of landscapes

Francesco Stella (University of Siena, Italy)

Poetic Landscape as a Memory Construction in the Latin Works of Petrarch

coffee break

10:50-12:10 chair: Farkas Kiss

Else Mundal (Centre for Medieval Studies, Bergen, Norway)

Memory of the past and Old Norse identity

Milena Bartlová (Masaryk University, Brno, Czech Republic)

***In memoriam defunctorum*: visual arts as devices of religious memory**

lunch

13:30-15:00

Final discussion, common project preparation, closing remarks

15:30-18:00

Tour through the medieval collection in the St. Agnes Convent led by Milena Bartlová

Final List of Participants (in alphabetical order)

Milena Bartlová
Dpt. of Art History FF MU Brno
Arne Nováka 1, Brno 602 00, Czech Republic
Tel.: +420549 49 3201
bartlova.m@seznam.cz
year of birth: 1958

Bergsveinn Birgisson
CMS, Bergen
University of Bergen
P.O.BOX 7805, N-5020 BERGEN
Tel: +47 555 88907
Fax: +47 55 58 80 90
bergsveinn.birgisson@nor.uib.no
year of birth: 1971

Irene Bueno
European University Institute, Firenze
Department of History and Civilization
Via Boccaccio 121
I-50133 Firenze
irenebuenow@yahoo.it
year of birth: 1978

Vincent Challet
Université Paul-Valéry Montpellier-III
Route de Mende 34199
Montpellier Cedex 05 France
Phone number: 00 33 4 67 14 22 76
Fax number: 00 33 4 67 14 26 95
vchallet@hotmail.com
year of birth: 1972

Greti Dinkova-Bruun
Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies,
Toronto
phone:(416) 926 1300, x 3440
greti.dinkova.bruun@utoronto.ca
year of birth: 1965?

Lucie Doležalová
Center for Theoretical Study, Jilská 1, 110 01
Praha, Czech Republic
phone: +420605758079
dolezalova@cts.cuni.cz
year of birth: 1977

Dávid Falvay
Department of Italian, University of Budapest
ELTE BTK
Múzeum krt. 4/F/221
1088 Budapest, Hungary
phone: 0036-1-411 6500 / 5156
fax: 0036-1-4855263
dfalvay@yahoo.com
year of birth: 1972

Carmen Florea
"Babes-Bolyai" University, Cluj-Napoca
Str. 21 Decembrie 1989, Nr. 47, ap. 1
3400, Cluj-Napoca, Romania
phone: 00-40-364401152
mobile phone: 00-40-744-512610
carmenfl@bcucluj.ro
year of birth: 1972

Cédric Giraud
University of Nancy II
23, boulevard Albert Ier, BP 3397, 54015
Nancy cedex
phone: 03 83 96 71 06
fax: 03 83 96 71 19.
cedricgiraud@gmail.com
year of birth: 1977

Laura Iseppi
University of Verona
Dipartimento di Linguistica, Letterature e
Scienze della Comunicazione
Via San Francesco, 22
37129 Verona
tel.: 0039 348 0057273
Laura.Iseppi@lettere.univr.it
year of birth: 1969

Farkas Kiss
Institute of Hungarian Culture and Literature,
Budapest
Múzeum krt. 4/a
Budapest, 1088
farqas@yahoo.com
year of birth: 1975
Regina Koycheva

Institute for Literature at the Bulgarian
Academy of Sciences, Sofia
VIII Floor, 17 Block, No. 52 Schipchenski
prohod Blvd
Phone: (+359 2) 9793996 or (+359 2) 9792997
Fax No: (+359 2) 9717056
reginaruf@yahoo.com
year of birth: 1974

József Laszlovszky
Dept. Of Medieval Studies, CEU, Budapest
Nádor utca 9
1051 Budapest
Tel: 36-1-327-3051
Fax: 36-1-327-3055
laszlovj@ceu.hu
year of birth: 1958

Andrea Livini
Dpt. de Filología Clásica e Indoeuropeo,
University of Salamanca
Plaza de Anaya s/n 37001, Salamanca
Phone: 0034- 923294657
alivini@yahoo.it
year of birth: 1977

Rüdiger Lorenz
Seminar für Lateinische Philologie des
Mittelalters, University of Freiburg
Werderring 8
79085 Freiburg
Tel: +49 761/203-3134
Fax: +49 761/203-3118
lorenz@mittellatein.uni-freiburg.de
year of birth: 1979

Milan Lyčka
Institute of Philosophy and Religious Studies,
FF UK Prague
nám. J. Palacha 2
116 38 Praha 1
Phone: +420221619356
Fax: + 420221619306
mlycka@quick.cz
year of birth: 1956

Ana Marinković

Art History Department, Philosophy Faculty,
University of Zagreb
Ivana Lucica 3, 10000 Zagreb, Croatia
phone: +385 1 6122143 or +385 98 9909680
anamarink@hotmail.com
year of birth: 1972

Stephanie Morley
Institute of Historical Research,
University of London
Mecklenburgh Square
London WC1N 2AN UK
Tel: +44 20 7837 8888 x5216
Fax: +44 20 7769 4722
morleysa@univmail.cis.mcmaster.ca
year of birth: 1970

Else Mundal
CMS, Bergen
University of Bergen
P.O.BOX 7805, N-5020 BERGEN
Tel: +47 555 82423
Fax: +47 55 58 80 90
else.mundal@cms.uib.no
year of birth: 1944

Elöd Nemerkenyi
Eotvos Collegium, University of Budapest
11-13 Menesi
Budapest 1118, Hungary
Phone: 36-20-420-4877
APHNEE01@alumni.ceu.hu
year of birth: 1973

William Purkis
Department of History, Queen Mary,
University of London
Mile End Road, E1 4NS London
william_purkis@hotmail.com
year of birth: 1978

Slavica Rankovic
CMS, Bergen
University of Bergen
P.O.BOX 7805, N-5020 BERGEN
Tel: +47 555 83043
Fax: +47 55 58 80 90
slavica.rankovic@cms.uib.no
year of birth: 1971
Lucia Raspe

Seminar für Judaistik, Johann Wolfgang
Goethe-Universität
Dantestraße 4-6
Postfach 11 19 32
D-60054 Frankfurt am Main
tel: +49 (0)69/798-23624
fax: +49 (0)69/798-23351
raspe@em.uni-frankfurt.de
year of birth: 1965

Kimberly Rivers
Department of History, University of
Wisconsin-Oshkosh
800 Algoma Blvd
Oshkosh, WI 54901
Tel.: +1 920-424-2451
Fax: +1 920 424 0938
rivers@uwosh.edu
year of birth: 1964

Victoria Smirnova
University of Geneva, Faculté des lettres
5, rue De-Candolle
CH-1211 Geneva
Phone: +41 22 379 71 11
Fax: +41 22 379 1029
herinaceus@mail.ru
year of birth: 1977

Francesco Stella
Dpt. di Teoria e Documentazione delle
Tradizioni Culturali, Uni. di Siena
Viale Cittadini, 33 - 52100 Arezzo
Tel. (0039) 0575.926315
Tel.: (0039)3346794244
055495398@iol.it
year of birth: 1962
Péter Tóth

Collection of Manuscripts, University Library
Budapest
Ferenciek tere 6
Budapest, H-1053
Tel.:36-1-4116777/3423
Fax:36-1-4116737
toth_p@ludens.elte.hu
year of birth: 1965

Tamás Visi
Kabinet judaistiky, FF UP Olomouc
Tř. 1. máje 1, 77180 Olomouc, Czech
Republic
Phone: +420731554358
Visi.tamas@gmail.com
year of birth: 1974

Jon Whitman
Department of English, The Hebrew
University of Jerusalem
Mount Scopus
Jerusalem 91905
Office tel.: 972-2-5883581; 972-2-5883901
Home tel.: 972-2-5664050
Home fax: 972-2-5667482
msjdw@mssc.huji.ac.il
year of birth: 1949

Rafał Wójcik
Adam Mickiewicz University Library in
Poznań
ul. Ratajczaka 38/40
61-816 Poznań
Tel.: +48 61 829 38 29
Fax.: +48 61 829 38 24
rafal@amu.edu.pl
year of birth: 1974

Statistics:

Participants from 15 different countries (12 ESF member countries plus Canada, the U.S.A. and Israel).

If we take into account also citizenship (besides the country of activity), we can add four more nationalities (Icelandic, Serbian, Finnish and Russian).

14 women out of 30 participants, i.e., 47% female participation
average age = 35.5 years