Executive Summary

The exploratory workshop examined the relationship between reasoning and rationality in a genuinely cross-disciplinary framework. It started off with a discussion of contemporary research into the pragmatic dimensions of rationality and moved on to consider the many-sided implications of ‘rationality at work’ in a variety of disciplines. This suggested the possibility of a new unifying framework, which distances itself from the received conceptions of deductive and inductive inference as it is related with a situational conception of reasoning.

The workshop was opened by introductory remarks by Maria Carla Galavotti and Roberto Scazzieri, who outlined the aims of the workshop, its interdisciplinary scope and its relationship with the objectives of the European Science Foundation.

The first session was devoted to an overview and critical discussion of pragmatic rationality (‘Practical Reason: State of the Arts and Research Perspectives’). The first workshop presentation, by Patrick Suppes (Stanford), examined rationality as the result of habits leading to specific conceptual associations, and contrasted this approach with the more traditional view linking rationality with preference-consistent choice (‘Habits versus Preferences as Predictors of Choice’). The following presentation, by J. Mitchell (Cambridge), focused on the relationship between rationality and irrationality and emphasized the continuum between these two apparently opposite criteria of human behaviour (‘Rationality and Irrationality’). Mitchell’s paper was followed by the two papers by S. Hartmann (London School of Economics) and Domenico Costantini...
Hartmann examined the role of probability inferences and probabilistic decision-making in scientific practice (‘Bayesianism and the Practice of Science’). Costantini addressed the issue of how rationality should be described once it is accepted that uncertainty is the ‘normal’ state of nature from an ontological point of view (‘Probability and Reasoning’). The second and third session of the workshop directly examined the relationship between rationality and cognitive processes (‘Cognitive Abilities and Mental Frames’).

In particular, J. Broome (Oxford) considered the role of rational standards in the evaluation of reasoning patterns (‘Rationality and Reasoning’), W. Rabinowicz (Lund) investigated the pragmatic motivations behind rationality constraints upon human behaviour (‘Pragmatic Arguments for Rationality Constraints’), S. Zamagni (Bologna) examined the relational foundations of rationality (‘Rationality and Relationality’). The afternoon session included the papers by R. Scassieri (Bologna), R. Hertwig (Basel), M. Klaes (Stirling), and S. Ngo-Mai (Nice). All four presentations emphasized, from different points of view, the role of relationality and social framing in the identification of effective rationality criteria. In particular, Scassieri addressed the issue of contingency with respect to the rational identification of co-ordination focal points (‘Coordination, Identity and Economic Contexts’), Hertwig analyzed the positive function of upper bounds upon human cognitive abilities in a context-dependent set-up (‘Ecological Rationality and the Benefits of Limited Cognitive Abilities’), Klaes addressed the nature of rationality in a setting characterized by the reflexivity of human deliberation (‘Rationality at Work: Social Framing and Reflexivity’), and Ngo-Mai considered the relationship between cognitive adaptation and self-organization (‘Cognitive Adaptation and Path Dependence’).

The fourth session looked at the wider issue of contexts as central determinants of reasoning patterns (‘Situations and Patterns of Reasoning’). In particular, P. Mello (Bologna) addressed the issue of situation in an artificial intelligence framework, and emphasized the role of abduction as the central reasoning ability in the setting of ‘open society’ (‘Abductive Reasoning in an Open Society’); R. Campaner (Bologna) discussed the specific structure of situational arguments in medical reasoning (‘Causation and Medical Reasoning: Therapies and Preemption’); T. R. Zuidema (University of Illinois)
examined the role of rationality as a type of ‘fitting ability’ in a comparative anthropological perspective (‘Rationality and Reasoning: An Anthropological Point of View’).

The exploratory workshop was concluded by a panel discussion in which participants emphasized the specific role of cross-disciplinary discussion in the analysis of reasoning patterns and in the pragmatic identification of rationality standards. In particular, the panel discussion explored the possibility of new collaborative initiatives, which would involve the Institute of Advanced Study of the University of Bologna, the London School of Economics, the University of Basel, the University of Cambridge, and other institutions. Finally, the discussion provided a first opportunity to examine contents and structure of the volume *Reasoning, Rationality and Probability* (editors M.C. Galavotti, R. Scazzieri and P. Suppes). This volume was stimulated by the workshop discussions and will partly be based upon the workshop proceedings. It will be published by CSLI Publications / Chicago University Press in the first semester of 2006.

*Scientific contribution of the exploratory workshop*

The workshop provided a cross-disciplinary forum for the exploration of pragmatic approaches to the theory of rationality. It offered the opportunity to discuss rationality as a feature of reasoning patterns in a variety of disciplines (primarily philosophy, economics, cognitive science, anthropology, artificial intelligence). The workshop has been an important stepping-stone towards the formation of a European research agenda on pragmatic rationality and patterns of reasoning. The workshop provided the starting point for collaborative research whose initial results will be published in the volume *Reasoning, Rationality and Probability* (edited by M.C. Galavotti, R. Scazzieri and P. Suppes), forthcoming CSLI Publications / Chicago University Press, 2006. The following research meetings have been or will be organized on its wake: *Causality, Probability and Rationality* (6-9 May 2005), Institute of Advanced Study, University of Bologna; *Probability, Rationality and Economics: the Contribution of Bruno de Finetti* (Fall 2006), Institute of Advanced Study, University of Bologna; *Plurality in Causality. Workshop I* (Spring 2006), Institute of Advanced Study, University of Bologna and
Assessment

The exploratory workshop consolidated existing cross-disciplinary links and encouraged the identification of new commonalities among a variety of disciplines. In particular, the workshop encouraged fresh collaborative research work, of which the volume *Reasoning, Rationality and Probability* (edited by M.C. Galavotti, R. Scazzieri and P. Suppes, forthcoming CSLI Publications / Chicago University Press, 2006), will be the first product.
FINAL PROGRAMME

Saturday 13 November 2004

Afternoon: Arrival of participants
20.00 Buffet dinner

Sunday 14 November 2004

Practical Reason: State of the Arts and Research Perspectives

10.00 – 10.15 Opening remarks (Director, Institute of Advanced Study, University of Bologna)
10.15 - 10.30 **M. C. Galavotti**: “Rationality and Patterns of Reasoning: Introductory Remarks”
10.30 – 10.45 **R. Scazzieri**: “Rationality and Patterns of Reasoning Introductory Remarks”
10.45 – 11.15 **P. Suppes**: “Habits vs. Preferences as Predictors of Choice”
11.15 – 11.45 Coffee break
11.45 – 13.00 Plenary discussion

Lunch

15.00 – 15.30 **J. Mitchell**: "Rationality and Irrationality”
15.30 – 16.00 **S. Hartmann**: “Bayesianism and the Practice of Science”
16.00 – 16.30 **D. Costantini**: “Probability and Reasoning”
16.30 – 17.00 Coffee break
17.00 – 18.30 Plenary discussion
20.00 Dinner

Monday 15 November 2004

Cognitive Abilities and Mental Frames

09.30 – 10.00 **J. Broome**: “Rationality and Reasoning”
10.00 – 10.30 **W. Rabinowicz**: “Pragmatic Arguments for Rationality Constraints”
10.30 – 11.00          **R. Scazzieri:** “Coordination, Identity and Economic Contexts”
11.00 – 11.30          *Coffee break*
11.30 – 13.00          Plenary discussion

**Lunch**

15.00 – 15.30          **S. Zamagni:** “Rationality and Relationality”
15.30 – 16.00          **R. Hertwig:** “Ecological Rationality and the Benefits of Limited Cognitive Abilities”
16.00 – 16.30          **M. Klaes:** “Rationality at work: Social Framing and Reflexivity”
16.30 – 17.00          *Coffee break*
17.00 – 18.30          Plenary discussion

20.00                  *Dinner*

**Tuesday 16 November 2004**

**Situations and Patterns of Reasoning**

09.30 – 10.00          **P. Mello:** “Abductive Reasoning in an Open Society”
10.00 – 10.30          **R. Campaner:** “Causation and Medical Reasoning. Therapies and Preemption”
10.30 – 11.00          **T.R. Zuidema:** “Rationality and Reasoning: An Anthropological Point of View”
11.00 – 11.30          *Coffee break*
11.30 – 13.00          Plenary discussion

**and Panel Discussion on Perspectives for Interdisciplinary Co-operation**

*Buffet lunch*

Departure
LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

Dr. Margherita Benzi  
Department of Philosophy  
University of Genova  
Via Balbi 4  
16126 Genova  
Italy  
Telephone: +39 10 2099845  
benzi@nous.unige.it

Professor John Broome  
White’s Professor of Moral Philosophy  
Corpus Christi College  
Oxford OX1 4JF  
United Kingdom  
Telephone: +44 1865 27 67 31  
Fax: +44 1865 27 67 67  
john.broome@philosophy.ox.ac.uk

Dr. Raffaella Campaner  
Department of Philosophy  
University of Bologna  
Via Zamboni 38  
Bologna 40126  
Italy  
Telephone: +39 051 209 83 15  
Fax: +39 051 209 83 55  
campanerr@hotmail.com

Dr. Gustavo Cevolani  
Department of Philosophy  
University of Bologna  
Via Zamboni 38  
Bologna 40126  
Italy  
Telephone: +39 051 209 83 15  
Fax: +39 051 209 83 55  
gcevolani@libero.it

Professor Domenico Costantini  
Department of Statistics  
University of Bologna  
Via Belle Arti 41  
40126 Bologna  
Telephone: +39 051 209 82 01  
Fax: +39 051 23 21 53  
costantinistudio@libero.it

Professor Maria Carla Galavotti  
Department of Philosophy  
University of Bologna  
Via Zamboni 38  
Telephone: +39 051 209 83 15  
Fax: +39 051 209 83 55  
Bologna 40126  
Italy  
mariacarla.galavotti@unibo.it

Dr. Paolo Giordani  
European University Institute  
Badia Fiesolana  
Via dei Roccettini,9  
50016 San Domenico di Fiesole (Firenze)  
Italy  
Telephone: +39 055 46851  
Fax: +39 055 4685 298  
p.giordani@uniroma.it

Dr. Ugo Gostoli  
Department of Economics  
University of Bologna  
Strada Maggiore 45  
Bologna 40 125  
Italy  
Telephone: +39 051 209 81 32  
Fax: +39 051 209 80 40  
ugostoli@hotmail.com

Dr. Stephen Hartmann  
Zentrum fur die Wissenschaftliches Nachwuchs  
Universitat Konstanz  
Postfach M682  
D- 78457 Konstanz  
Telephone: +49 07531  884 885  
Current position and address:  
Director, Centre for the Philosophy of Natural and Social Science  
Department of Philosophy, Logic and Scientific Method  
London School of Economics and Political Science  
Houghton Street  
London WC2A  2AE  
United Kingdom  
Telephone: +44 207955 6323  
S.Hartmann@lse.ac.uk
Professor Ralph Hertwig  
Fakultät für Psychologie  
Universität Basel  
Missionsstrasse 60/62  
4055 Basel  
Schweiz/Switzerland  
Telephone:+4161/2670611  
Fax: +41 61 / 267 35 26  
Ralph Hertwig <ralph.hertwig@unibas.ch>  

Professor Matthias Klaes  
School of Economic and Management Studies  
Darwin Building  
University of Keele  
Staffordshire  
ST5 5BG  
Tel. +44 (0)1782 584279  
m.klaes@keele.ac.uk  

Professor Paola Mello  
Department of Electronics, Computer Science and Systems  
University of Bologna  
Viale Risorgimento 11  
Bologna 40136  
Italy  
Telephone: +39 051 209 38 18  
Fax: +39 051 209 30 73  
pmello@deis.unibo.it  

Professor Juliet Mitchell  
Professor of Psychoanalysis and Gender Studies  
Jesus College  
Cambridge CB5 8BL  
United Kingdom  
Telephone: +44 1223 339 339  
Fax: +44 1223 339 313  
jcwm@hermes.cam.ac.uk  

Dr. Stephane Ngo-Mai  
IDEFI-LATAPSES  
Université de Nice- Sophia Antipolis  
3735, rue des Dolines  
Les Bouillides  
Sophia Antipolis  
France  
Telephone : +33 4 93 00 41 64  
gomai@idefi.cnrs.fr  

Professor Wlodek Rabinowicz  
Professor of Practical Philosophy  
Department of Philosophy  
University of Lund  
Kungshuset,  
SE-22222  
Lund  
Sweden  
Telephone: +46 046 222 75 95  
Fax: +46 046 222 44 24  
włodek.rabinowicz@fil.lu.se  

Professor Roberto Scazzieri  
Deputy Director, Institute of Advanced Study and Professor of Economic Analysis,  
Department of Economics  
University of Bologna  
Villa Gandolfi Pallavicini  
Via Martelli 22-24  
40138 Bologna  
Italy  
Telephone: +39 051 209 81 32  
Fax: +39 051 209 80 40  
rs292@cam.ac.uk  

Professor Patrick Suppes  
Lucie Stern Professor of Philosophy, Emeritus  
Centre for the Study of Language and Information  
Ventura Hall, University of Stanford  
Stanford, California 94 305 - 4115  
USA  
Mail Address: Department of Philosophy,  
Building 90, Stanford University  
Stanford, California 94 305 – 2155  
Telephone: 650 725 6030  
suppes@csli.stanford.edu  

Dr. Romano Trabalzini  
Department of Economics  
University of Siena  
Piazza San Francisco,7  
I-53100 Siena  
Italy  
Telephone: +39 (0) 577 232620  
Fax: +39 (0)577 232661  
romano.trabalzini@geldesgeistes@yahoo.it
Professor Stefano Zamagni  
Department of Economics  
University of Bologna  
Piazza Scaravilli, 2  
40126 Bologna  
Italy  
Telephone: +39 051 209 81 32  
Fax: +39 051 209 80 40  
veste@economia.unibo.it

Professor Tom R. Zuidema  
Centre for Advanced Studies  
University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign  
912, West Illinois Street  
Urbana, IL  
61801 USA  
Telephone: 217 333 6729  
Fax: 217 244 3396  
rtzuidem@uiuc.edu
STATISTICAL INFORMATION

EUROPEAN SCIENCE FOUNDATION EXPLORATORY WORKSHOP
‘RATIONALITY AND PATTERNS OF REASONING: A EUROPEAN PERSPECTIVE’
Convenor: Roberto Scazzieri; Co-convenor : Maria Carla Galavotti; Local Organizer: Raffaella Campaner
(University Residential Centre, University of Bologna, Bertinoro, 14-16 November 2004)

Participants from Europe: 18

Participants from outside Europe: 2

Graduate students (from Europe): 4

Participants’ countries of provenance:
Germany, France, Italy, Sweden, Switzerland, United Kingdom, United States of America