Evaluation at CNR: Autoevaluation annual reports

S.S. Chen & A. M. Stilo
Operative Programming Office

ESF workshop: “Evaluation of Funding Schemes and Research Programmes”
INFN Headquarters - Rome
31st March – 1st April 2008
Mission: Perform, promote, broaden, transfer and improve research activities in the main development fields of knowledge for scientific, technologic, economic and social Italian development.

CNR is the wider research public structure in Italy. The scientific fields of the more than 100 Institutes cover a variety of issues from Humanities to Nanotechnology.
Introduction: CNR’s organization

Direct collaboration Offices
Board of Auditors

President

Head Office

Central Administration Offices
- Central Programming and Infrastructure Management
- Central Resources Management

Scientific Network
- Departments
- Institutes
- Research Area Services
Introduction: performing research at CNR

- **107 institutes**, located in about 300 different sites around the country;
- **11 scientific departments (SD)**
- **83 research projects**
- **More than 4,000 researchers**
CNR Regulation defines evaluation for:

- Research products of scientific network
- General objectives of research activity
- Results of research activities
- Long term programmes according to Ministry programmes

Autoevaluation closes evaluation procedures and it is performed by:

- Department Chiefs
- Institute Directors
- Single Researchers
Evaluation at CNR - Levels

- **External Evaluation (CIVR)**
  - National evaluation committee
  - Three years of activities are evaluated (last

- **Strategic and management evaluation of CNR’s structures**
  - Performed by Board of Directors
  - Both research activities and management are evaluated
  - Institutes and Departments contribute with RD and RI

- **Institutes and Departments autoevaluation**
  - Annual report

- **Researchers’ evaluation**
  - Annual report on their activity
**Main aim:** get an overview on Institutes through different elements such as: scientific production on existing issues, analyze the possibility of opening new research activities, new competences and new technologies needs, collaboration with internal and external groups.

**Articulation:** 120 division areas clustered in 29 main fields.

**Main criteria:** Institutes will be evaluated, in relation with their main field, on

- Skills
- Consistency
- Particularity
- Collaboration and relationship networks
- Development potential
- External incomes
- Social and economic impact
Definition of indicators: define a number of rational parameters related to Institutes critical mass

Common indicators: such as intellectual, relationship, structural, economic and production assets.

Specific indicators: such as quantity and quality of scientific products and innovation value of research programmes
Evaluation at CNR: how evaluation is performed

- General Panel
  - Warranter and in charge in front of the Board of Directors regarding evaluation process

- Area Panels
  - Area Panel 1
  - Area Panel 2
  - ... Area Panel 29

- Institutes
  - Institute 001
  - Institute 002
  - ... Institute 107

- Process
  - 16 experts selected on different subjects
  - Supervision the whole evaluation process
  - Designation of the Area Panel’s experts
  - Summary and report of the Area Panel’s evaluation
  - Analyse documents and papers produced in the last 5 years
  - On site visit
  - Produce an annual final report on the evaluated activity
  - Each Institute is evaluated by one or more Area Panels according to their research area
Autoevaluation – Who and how

Departments
- Directors draft the report
  - Department scientific board acceptation
    - Annual Autoevaluation Report on Department’s activity

Institutes
- Directors draft the report
  - Institute board and Departments acceptation
    - Annual Autoevaluation Report on Institute’s activity and critical points

Researchers
- Research team Leaders draft
  - Institute board
    - Annual Report on research activity
      - Know how acquired
      - Collaborations
      - Scientific results

On line Application
- [Gestione Dipartimenti]
- [Gestione Istituti]
- [Piani di Gestione]
Fill up a form in the dedicated **on line application**.

Each Department or Institute has to describe **autoevaluation elements**, explaining discrepancies between ex post results and ex ante targets, and propose organizational structure improvements.

These reports are **published** in CNR’s official documents.
Autoevaluation reports - on line application
Autoevaluation reports – Researchers

- Research Group Leaders fill in dedicated online forms in two different moments:
  - During the budgeting process.
  - In the scientific results reports

- For each research activity Group leaders must define:
  - Achieved Results
  - Used utilities
  - Critical points
  - Partnerships
  - Comments to discrepancies between ex post results and ex ante targets
Autoevaluation reports - Researchers [budgeting process]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Risultati conseguiti</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Risorsse strumentali</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Punti critici</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collaborazioni</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Commento ad eventuali scostamenti tra le entrate previste e quelle realizzate nell’anno.
Autoevaluation reports – Pubblication

- **Departments**: Departments Annual reports. They expose information regarding the Department.

- **Institutes**: Autoevaluation annual report.

- **Research Group Leaders**: Activities progress annual report

Evaluation Panels analyze all these documents to complete the evaluation process