ESF Member Forum on Peer Review
Brussels 19-20 May 2010

Survey on Peer Review Practices

Katharina Fuchs-Bodde
ESF Office, Strasbourg
Overview

1. Preliminary work
   + MO Forum Peer Review
   + Requirements resulting from the ESF/Eurohorcs Roadmap
   + ESF office & consultancy

2. Final content of the survey

3. Pilot launch

4. Full launch
May 2009: Decision on survey elements by MO Forum

To collect typical procedures for:
• Peer review for 'normal research grants programmes'
• Review panels
• Interdisciplinary research proposals
• Breakthrough research proposals
• Right to reply
• Incentives

July 2009: Provision of building blocks for survey by MO Forum members
July 2009: Additional requirement resulting from the Roadmap

- Selection and recruitment of peer reviewers (incl. time burden + conflict of interests)
- Quality assurance of peer review processes
- Facilitating reviewers exchange (‘Database’) 
- Adopting a common classification of research fields
Preliminary work

August – October 2009: Drafting of Survey by ESF office

• Based on building blocks provided by MO Forum members
• Based on requirements of the Roadmap
Preliminary work

November 2009: Decisions MO Forum
Agreement on present structure

January – March 2010: Implementation of the survey in cooperation with a consultancy
Final content of the survey

Introductory questions

• General information on participating organisations
• Identification of funding instruments to be described in Part 2 of the survey
Final content of the survey

Part 1 – General policies

- Organisational aspects
- Research classification system
- Quality assurance
- Managing data on reviewers
- College/Pool of Reviewers
- Incentives
- Right to reply
- Interdisciplinary Research Proposals
- Breakthrough Research Proposals
Final content of the survey

Part 2 – Characteristics of specific funding instruments

• Handling of proposals/office organisation
• Eligibility
• Selection of reviewers
• Conflict of interest
• Preliminary selection
• Remote review
• Panel review
Pilot launch

Duration
29 March – 11 April

Participants:
1. EPSRC, UK
2. INFN, Italy
3. Academy of Finland, Finland
4. ESF, France

Completed perfectly in time by all participants

Total mean time needed (self-reported)
23 hours
Participants’ feedback

- Procedure and instruction very clear
- Questions very clear, with some exceptions; denomination of 5-10 questions that needed clarification
- No shortening of questionnaire suggested, all discussed aspects valued as relevant
- Stronger adaptation for international organisations needed
- Online tool working well
Participating organisations

- ESF member organisations
- EUROHORCS member organisations

Invited for participation

- Other European funding organisations
- Other European charities
- Non-European funding organisations

Timeline

Launch: 14.05.
Final submission: 11.06.